

Review of Career, Information, Advice, Guidance and Education (CIAGE)

Discussion Paper

Purpose

1. The purpose of this discussion paper is to:
 - a. help us better understand what happens now in CIAGE,
 - b. test our understanding of problems and barriers to improvement, and
 - c. seek your views on how we can improve CIAGE for learners and their families.

Introduction

1. Young people need to make more effective transitions between secondary education, tertiary education and work, as part of moving to successful adulthood. The Government has already taken steps towards this through the roll-out of the Youth Guarantee, which includes fees-free places in tertiary education and secondary-tertiary partnerships such as Trades Academies. The development of the vocational pathways and the current review of industry training will also contribute to better transitions.
2. The Government wants to improve the way young people are supported in navigating their way through the various transitions. Effective transitions are more likely when young people can make well-informed choices in the qualifications and careers they pursue. Therefore Government is reviewing career information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) for young people.
3. As part of improving transitions, the Government wants to increase the number of New Zealanders with relevant qualifications. This means increasing the number achieving a minimum of NCEA Level 2 or an equivalent tertiary qualification. NCEA Level 2, as a gateway qualification, allows learners to progress to further education and training that leads to sustainable employment. At the same time, there needs to be an increase in the number of people with Level 4 qualifications or above because these qualifications lead to higher life time earnings.
4. In particular, we want better achievement rates for Māori learners, Pasifika learners, learners with special education needs, and learners from low socio-economic backgrounds. These learners achieve NCEA Level 2 at lower rates than other groups and go on to achieve at lower rates at the tertiary level.
5. Māori and Pasifika students are less likely to leave school with the qualifications they need to progress into higher education and training or employment. Students with special education needs or disabilities also find transitions difficult.

6. We know we need to improve the quality of CIAGE provision to help learners while they are at school and while they are making transitions to tertiary education and employment. This is because:
- The rate of non-completion of courses and qualifications, while improving, is still too high. There are a range of reasons for this. Research undertaken by the Starpath Project at the University of Auckland, especially a report titled *Stepping Stones and Stumbling Blocks*, outlines how important it is to ensure that NCEA choices will lead to relevant and meaningful tertiary options.¹ The Starpath study also highlighted the importance of good pastoral care, effective teaching practices and self motivation.
 - We continue to have low levels of achievement for particular groups, notably Māori learners, Pasifika learners and learners with special education needs. While there has been some increase in achievement rates of Māori and most Pacific groups, learner outcomes have not improved to the level of non-Māori learners. In 2009, 53 percent of Māori learners gained an NCEA Level 2 or above qualification compared with 70 percent of other ethnicities. In the same year, 49 percent of year 12 Pasifika learners gained an NCEA level 2 or above qualification compared with 69 percent of other ethnicities.²
 - We have significant numbers of young people who are not engaged in education, employment or training (NEET). As at December 2011, 9.7 percent of 15-19 year olds were classed as being NEET.³ This represents over 30,000 young people. On average across OECD countries, the proportion of NEETS among 15-19 year-olds is 8.4%.

Why we need CIAGE

7. The concept of a 'career' has changed significantly in recent years. It can comprise a number of 'careers' as people transition in, out and within the labour market. Careers may include full-time and part-time work or study, and any combination of paid work, time spent caring for others and voluntary work. Most people will need to change careers and/or re-train at some point in their lives.
8. The range of work is also changing more rapidly than in the past. Many more jobs require good literacy and numeracy skills, and a range of interpersonal skills such as working in teams. CIAGE needs to prepare learners for the real world of work and the type of 'career' that they will need to manage.

¹ Madjar, I., McKinley, E., Deynzer, M., van der Merwe, A. (2010). *Stumbling blocks or stepping stones? Students' experience of transition from low-mid decile schools to university*. Auckland: Starpath Project, The University of Auckland.

² Ed Counts November 2010.

³ December 2011 quarterly household labour force survey results – <http://www.dol.govt.nz/publications/lmr/lmr-hlfs-summary.asp>.

9. These changing patterns of work and education provide much greater choice for learners and their families and whānau. Career decisions are more complex. The impact of uninformed decisions about education, training and employment can be costly for individuals, families and whānau and New Zealand.
10. A number of factors restrict the ability of learners to make good education choices:
- Learners need to make significant decisions about their education at a young age, without direct experience of further education or the employment it can lead to.
 - Parents, family and whānau are key influencers on learners' education choices and decisions. However, their own experience and/or knowledge can be limited and/or dated.
 - Limited expectations by teachers, advisers, family and whānau, and learners themselves, can restrict choices for learners.
 - There is a mass of information available to learners and many sources of advice are of varying quality, accuracy and currency.
 - Providers (both schools and tertiary) may not provide the best advice. They may direct learners into education pathways that are provided by the institution rather than pathways which would most benefit the learner.
11. The international literature suggests that effective CIAGE can:
- help people make better decisions about tertiary study and employment
 - help more learners complete a qualification and make better transitions from education to the labour market
 - support equal opportunities and promote social inclusion.

Parameters for the review

12. The review covers career information, advice, guidance and education for young people from around age 11 (year 7) to around age 19. This includes CIAGE across schools and tertiary settings.
13. The review does not specifically include STAR funding, Gateway funding or the Guidance Counsellor role in schools. However, this review may have some impact on other activities in schools and tertiary organisations. The review also does not include career services for adults but similarly, there may be an impact on services to other groups.

Discussion and feedback

14. The next section of the paper provides an overview of CIAGE. It sets out what effective CIAGE would look like, describes what happens now and identifies key issues. The rest of the paper is separated into sections on career information, career advice, career guidance and career education. You can respond to all sections of the paper or only the questions on one or more sections.
15. The individual sections describe what happens now, identify key issues, suggest broad changes we could make and seek your comments.
16. We provide a brief description of each element of CIAGE here. There is further explanation in the relevant sections.
 - **Career education** is the process by which learners develop career management competencies. The Ministry of Education's guidelines to schools (*Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools 2009* identify the career management competencies). They are:
 - Developing self-awareness.
 - Exploring opportunities.
 - Deciding and acting.
 - **Career information** includes data on education, training, occupations, industries and the labour market.
 - **Career advice** is specific information in response to a request or question and, with career information, is the 'what' people need to know.
 - **Career guidance** focuses on interpreting and applying information for career planning management purposes and/or developing the underlying career management competencies.
17. We will use your comments to help us develop better ways of providing a system of CIAGE that combines all the elements. We will want to make sure the system as a whole helps learners lift achievement and make better transitions into further education, training and work.

Career Information, Advice, Guidance and Education (CIAGE) System Overview

Outcome

Learners have the skills and knowledge they need to make well-informed choices at key stages in schools and in the transition to tertiary study and employment. Learners who need more help can access extra support.

Description

An ideal system for New Zealand, based on New Zealand and international research on effective CIAGE⁴, would have the following features and components:

- Every learner would receive career education starting from around year seven and integrated into the curriculum. Career education would build the career-related competencies that would enable people to manage their own career.
- Every learner would have access to high-quality, independent career information delivered through a range of media. This would help them to make informed decisions about subject choices, the nature and level of study to follow, and careers and occupations.
- Every learner could access career advice when they needed extra help to make well-informed career-related choices. This could include providing extra information about employment outcomes, working conditions, advice on how to get specific work experience opportunities or advice on the career implications of subject choices at school or in tertiary providers.
- Learners who needed more individualised assistance would have access to career guidance to help them work through their education, training and career options, particularly at key transition points.
- Learners who need more help (e.g. health including mental health, disability, family/whānau issues) have access to more intensive career assistance as part of a wider set of supports.
- All CIAGE services would:
 - encourage learners to consider a wide range of roles without restriction based on ethnicity, gender and other characteristics. Services would inspire students to see the value of education and skills through high expectations of the career potential of students
 - be well-connected to social and cultural networks which influence young people, particularly their parents, families and whānau as key influencers.
 - be underpinned by effective engagement with industry and tertiary education, particularly at key decision points
 - respond to the identity, language and culture of all learners
 - in particular, meet the needs of those groups of learners who have lower levels of educational participation and attainment.

⁴ Includes OECD, *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap 2004*, *Best Practice in Careers Education and Guidance*, Connexions, Nottinghamshire, 2006, ERO, *The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools*, ERO, Wellington, 2006, *Career developments (May 2011)* a publication on the Canadian Career Development Foundation website: www.ccdf.ca.

Current situation

18. Schools provide learners with a mix of CIAGE services, in a range of ways. Many schools have a career advisor and some get support from Careers New Zealand. Teachers may deliver career education as part of the curriculum.
19. Schools receive various funds to help provide CIAGE. This includes:
- staffing and operational funding for delivering the curriculum
 - specific funding for career information (the CIG grant)
 - the salary costs of career advisors (the proportion of time that career advisors spend on CIAGE varies from school to school)
 - a career advisors allowance paid to designated career advisors. In 2011, 324 teachers were paid this allowance.
20. Under the National Administration Guidelines (NAGs), schools are required to "provide appropriate career education for all students in Year 7 and above, with a particular emphasis on specific career guidance for those students who have been identified by the school as being at risk of leaving school unprepared for the transition to the workplace or further education/training."⁵
21. Tertiary providers are not required to provide CIAGE services and they are not specifically funded for CIAGE. However, many do provide some career services to their learners. In public providers, this is often as part of their wider student support services. Services are funded through student services fees, tuition subsidies and student fees. More recently, providers are using the Youth Guarantee tertiary providers' per-head funding to provide elements of CIAGE. As in the schools sector however, provision is mixed. Some providers focus mainly on career information and advice, while others also focus on building career-related competencies. Some organisations have qualified career staff while others rely on classroom tutors.
22. Careers New Zealand provides a range of CIAGE services including web-based and phone-based career information and advice, capability building in schools and in the community and a small level of services on a fee-for-services basis. Careers New Zealand has also trialled work with whānau and Māori medium schools. Careers New Zealand estimates that about 46 percent of its funding is used to support young people.
23. There is also a small private market that provides career services to individuals on a fee-for-service basis.

⁵ NAG 1 (f).

Key issues

24. A 2006 review by the Education Review Office (ERO)⁶ found that only 11 percent of primary schools and 12 percent of secondary schools provided high quality career education and guidance to their learners. A review carried out by the New Zealand Council for Educational Research in 2007⁷ also found that CIAGE performance in schools was uneven.
25. Specific findings of these reviews included that:
- there was an emphasis on providing information about jobs rather than helping learners learn how to manage their own career
 - links between schools and key influencers on young people such as parents and whānau were weak
 - many schools did not have ways of identifying young people at risk of making poor transitions
 - there was a general lack of provision catering effectively for the needs of Māori and Pasifika learners
 - many schools made career education a low priority
 - few career advisors hold career-specific qualifications, many have lower status than other management roles and most practitioners hold more than one role in a school.
26. Since then, the Ministry of Education has provided guidelines to schools on how to provide career education and guidance in schools⁸. Careers New Zealand has also worked in many schools helping them improve their ability to help learners and has developed the Career Education Benchmarks to help schools assess their own provision⁹.
27. The provision of CIAGE in schools and tertiary providers is variable. For example, some schools provide excellent CIAGE services to their learners. Career education is well-integrated into the curriculum, other career services are approached holistically and are strongly focused on those who need these services most; and there are strong links to both parents and whānau and local employers. Other schools and tertiary providers appear to provide a low level of CIAGE services to their learners. Most schools and tertiary providers fall somewhere between these two extremes, with some elements of good practice but room for improvement.
28. This variability was a major theme of ERO's review of career education and guidance in schools in 2006. ERO has provided provisional results from the national review now being undertaken. These results signal that, although there has been an evolution of practice towards a more individual and personalised approach, the success of schools in making this change is variable.
29. Very little research has been conducted on how well tertiary providers provide CIAGE services to their learners. Career staff in larger organisations tend to have formal professional qualifications and belong to a professional association

⁶ ERO, *The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools*, ERO, Wellington, 2006.

⁷ Vaughan, K and Gardiner, B, *Careers Education in New Zealand Schools*, NZCER, 2007.

⁸ Ministry of Education, *Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools* (2009).

⁹ Careers New Zealand, *Career Education Benchmarks* (2011).

that gives them access to professional development. However we do not know whether this translates into more effective services for learners.

30. Tertiary education organisations working in the former 'youth training' space are subject to measures that include students moving into work or further training but do not include CIAGE services. Small private training establishments appear to provide some level of career advice as part of a pastoral care role.
31. A key issue for the system overall is how to best meet the needs of every learner within the range of diverse groups that exist in New Zealand. In particular, we need to consider how to meet the needs of those groups who are currently identified as priority groups within the education system. These are: Māori learners, Pasifika learners, learners with special education needs and those of low socio-economic level.
32. It will be important to ensure that priority groups are not restricted by preconceptions of where and what they should study. For example, research by the University of Auckland, following up on earlier studies, showed that Māori and Pacific students tend to be enrolled in less academic subjects and unit rather than achievement standards, and to complete fewer credits from the approved list of subjects (required for completion of the UE qualification)¹⁰. Other research suggests Pasifika learners are more likely to be directed into lower levels of education and training than non-Pasifika learners¹¹.
33. Technological advances provide some opportunities to deliver CIAGE in more cost-effective ways. For example, Price Waterhouse Coopers (PwC) estimates that, compared to online channels, call-centre services are 20 times more expensive, postal services 40 times more expensive and face-to-face services 200 times more expensive¹². However online channels may not meet the needs of all groups. For example, work by Careers New Zealand on whānau engagement indicates that some groups may respond better to situations that involve personal relationships and face-to-face delivery. In addition, many learners may not be able to easily access information from the internet, such as those from low socio-economic backgrounds or those with low literacy levels.
34. A recent survey of employers¹³ suggested that many employers felt career advisers in schools lacked up-to-date information on industry. Employers surveyed felt that more could be done in schools to inform learners about opportunities in industry. Employers, particularly larger employers, and industry groups, can provide up to date information about local trends and labour market conditions and a 'reality check' for learners about life in their industry. We need to consider how the linkages between schools and industry can be made part of an integrated approach to helping learners to make informed study and career choices.

¹⁰ University of Auckland; Towards University: *Navigating NCEA course choices in low-mid decile schools*, 2009.

¹¹ Hipkins et al, 2004; Statistics NZ and the Ministry of Pacific Island Affairs, 2010, p.11; Madjar et al, 2009.

¹² Better Public Services Advisory Group Report <http://www.dpmc.govt.nz/sites/all/files/bps/bps-report-nov11.pdf>.

¹³ Undertaken by the Ministry of Education as part of the current Industry Training Review.

Career Education

Outcome

Every learner is able to manage their own learning and work choices over a lifetime.

Description

Career education is the process by which learners develop career-related competencies. The Ministry identified the career-related competencies in its guidelines to schools (*Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools 2009*). They are:

- developing self-awareness
- exploring opportunities
- deciding and acting.

The competencies reflect the overall vision and values in the New Zealand Curriculum and have a strong relationship with the key competencies.

- Developing self-awareness links to managing self and relating to others.
- Exploring opportunities links to thinking critically, using language, symbols and texts and relating to others.
- Deciding and acting links thinking and participating and contributing.

The competencies built on similar work by the OECD, Canada and Australia.

Current situation

NAG 1(f) covers career education and guidance in schools. The Ministry of Education, with Careers New Zealand (then Career Services), produced guidelines to help schools deliver career education and guidance in schools in 2009. *The Career Education and Guidance in Schools* guidelines suggest ways that staff in schools can help learners to develop the career management competencies they need to have to be able to manage their own career.

More recently, Careers New Zealand has published *Career Education Benchmarks* which is a self review tool which schools can use to assess their provision of career education. The career management competencies are reflected in the career education benchmarks.

Schools carry out the NAG in many ways. Some schools provide some measure of career education to all their learners and some target those that appear to need help. Some employ dedicated career staff who work with teachers in the school. Careers New Zealand works intensively with 60 schools as part of its baseline activity and has provided additional support for a further 383 schools¹⁴. This work is focused on building capability within the school so career and teaching staff can deliver career education.

¹⁴ These schools are selected on the basis of need, willingness and success factors, with a focus on low-decile schools. In 2012/11, CNZ worked intensively with 58 schools. This comprised 40,800 learners - 19% Māori learners and 13% Pasifika. See www2.careers.govt.nz (annual report year ended 30 June 2011).

Tertiary providers are not required to include career education in their programmes. Larger providers employ some capacity to deliver a range of career services but this is more likely to be focused on information and advice rather than career education.

Key issues

Studies¹⁵ show us that schools continue to prioritise the provision of information rather than the development of career management competencies. This, and the range of ways that schools provide career education, raise questions over the consistency of quality provision.

The ways in which learners get information are also changing. The sheer volume of information can be overwhelming for learners. Learners receive information from schools, tertiary providers, career organisations, employers, industry groups, families and whānau, and friends. This information is not always accurate or current. An important part of career education is being able to access and use information suitably.

International evidence strongly suggests that career education works best when it is an integral part of what a school or provider does. This happens when schools and providers are deeply committed to enabling all their learners to make effective well-considered transitions to further education and training and work. This commitment starts with leadership from principals and senior managers in schools and providers. The evidence suggests that currently, not many schools in New Zealand have embedded career education into the way they work.

Overseas experience shows us that, when career education is delivered from within the school, it tends to have weak links with the real world of work. However, we also know that, when career education is provided from outside the school, it tends to have weak links with the curriculum.¹⁶ This would suggest that either method of delivery would need some change to ensure there are effective links between the curriculum and the external world of work.

Tertiary providers have not had a duty to provide career education. However there will be learners enrolling in tertiary institutions who do not have the career management competencies they need. An issue in the tertiary sector is whether providers have a role helping learners develop these competencies if needed and what Government should expect of providers.

Possible changes

How do we ensure that learners receive effective career education that helps them to navigate the transitions within school and from school to further training and/or work? Some ideas are set out below:

- (A) We could clarify Government's expectations of schools and tertiary providers. This might include clear and simple guidelines for each sector.
- (B) We could strengthen the accountability for schools and tertiary providers. This could be done through raising the importance of career education in ERO reviews and similar reporting for the tertiary sector.

¹⁵ ERO, *The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools*, ERO, Wellington, 2006.

¹⁶ OECD, *Career guidance and public policy: Bridging the Gap* (2004), p. 39.

- (C) We could clarify who is best placed to deliver career education and what support they would need to do this well. The role could be carried out by teachers and tutors, a specialist teacher or a career specialist.
- (D) Schools and tertiary institutions could contract in the career education role from outside of the school, either through a central agency or a network of private providers.

Key questions

1. What are the barriers that prevent some schools from delivering effective career education?
2. What would enable schools and tertiary provider leadership to embed CIAGE into their practices?
3. Who should deliver career education – teachers, a specialist teacher, an in-house career adviser or by contracting expertise from outside the school?
4. How do we ensure career education is delivered in ways that meet the needs of diverse groups, and in particular, priority groups?
5. How can schools and tertiary providers link effectively with parents, families and whānau?
6. How do we know that every learner is developing the career management competencies to an appropriate level?
7. What responsibility should tertiary providers have for learners who are continuing to develop career management competencies at enrolment?
8. What options could be available for those who are already at risk of disengaging from education and work, or who have already disengaged?

Career Information

Outcome

Every young person can access high quality career information that helps them make informed career related decisions and manage their career effectively.

Description

Career information includes data on education, training, occupations and the labour market. Effective career information has a number of key characteristics. It is:

- *Relevant* – it is stage- and age- specific, and speaks to a range of users including learners, teachers, parents, families, whānau, hapū and iwi.
- *Accurate* – the information and advice is up to date and factually correct.
- *Comprehensive* – it covers the range of information users need to make informed decisions. This includes information about occupations and careers, the education and training required for these occupations, who provides this education and training, how much it costs and how effective are these providers.
- *Accessible* – it is delivered in a range of media and languages. This includes in written word, audio, video or multi-media formats.
- *Impartial and objective* – users can be confident that the information and advice is not biased.

Current situation

Careers New Zealand provides extensive web-based information accessible to young people and their influencers. This includes job, industry, course, training and labour market information online. Careers New Zealand under-takes various evaluations of user satisfaction of its services, including the information role, and these generally show a positive result.

ERO found in its 2006 review that interactions between learners and career advisers in schools were focused around providing information¹⁷.

The Tertiary Education Commission has recently published information on its website about how tertiary providers perform. This enables young people to get comparative information about which providers have the better qualification and course completion rates. In addition, the Government is now exploring how to make information on the labour market outcomes achieved by tertiary education graduates publicly available. The Department of Labour also provides labour market information on its website.

In addition, numerous organisations, such as industry training organisations and tertiary providers, provide information on education and training and career options. This information is disseminated via websites, paper-based products and career expos run in main centres including INZONE.¹⁸ Some of this information, which is variable in quality, is however heavily promoted, making it easily accessible by learners.

¹⁷ ERO, *The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools*, ERO, Wellington, 2006.

¹⁸ INZONE is a mobile career information expo delivered through technology. Partners currently include some government agencies and some Industry Training Organisations.

Finally, there is much evidence that young people rely heavily on parents, whānau and peers for information on careers, education and training.

Key issues

There are signals that the career information role is working better than other aspects of CIAGE. However, we have little information about how effective current career information services are and how easy it is for learners to access and what impact the information and advice has on their future decisions. We would value feedback on these questions. We would value feedback from practitioners and users about the effectiveness of all current career information for learners and their influencers, from all sources.

Career information that is crucial for learners to have access to can be presented from the perspective of a particular employer, institution or path of study. Each piece of career information is often promotional and/or incomplete but will still form an important part of the overall picture for learners. However learners, and often their key influencers, are inexperienced consumers faced with a mass of information to navigate their way through – both to assess its quality and to put it in the context of other information to form an overall picture.

A key issue is how we can provide learners with useful, relevant and engaging information while still providing suitable protection and context for those who are not yet informed consumers.

We are particularly interested in any feedback from key target groups, that is Māori, Pasifika learners, learners with special education needs and learners from low socio-economic backgrounds as to what current career information sources would meet their needs.

Possible changes

Ensuring learners can access high quality career information highlights two key questions, first, who produces the career information and second, who moderates and quality assures that information. Many organisations create career information. Government currently moderates and quality-assures some career information from diverse sources, so that learners can be confident that each piece of information is accurate and that, collectively, the information is comprehensive. It also presents information in a range of ways to make it accessible to young people. There may also be a residual role for Government to produce specific pieces of career information to fill gaps in provision.

- (A) Government could work more closely with schools, other education providers, and business to gain access to a wider range of career information while providing a quality assurance role that ensures career information is relevant, accurate, comprehensive and accessible.
- (B) Learners could continue to access information from a range of sources with clear expectations on schools and tertiary providers to ensure the information they provide is accurate, relevant, comprehensive and accessible.

- (C) The funding for career information could be related to the function of providing career information rather than any particular delivery model or role.

Key questions

1. How do learners access career information now and who or what are their main sources?
2. What types of information are most useful:
 - a. for learners?
 - b. for learners with special education needs?
 - c. for other at risk learners?
 - d. for parents, families and whānau?
 - e. for teachers, tutors and career staff?
3. How can we make the most effective use of information produced by tertiary providers, employers and business organisations?
4. What would be the best way to provide career information to those who are at risk of disengaging?
5. What information is not currently available or not easily available, or not available in the right format (e.g. to allow access for the deaf or visually impaired) which could help young people at key transition points to make more informed decisions about education, training and careers?

Career Advice

Outcome

Career advice is available to help young people make informed career-related decisions and manage their career effectively.

Description

Career advice is specific information in response to a request or question and, along with career information, is the 'what' people need to know. It can occur in person, or via phone, text or a range of web-based services. It is the 'value-add' to career information and often includes more specific and/or more individualised information.

Current situation

Learners receive career advice from a range of sources: through career advisers in both schools and tertiary institutions, from teachers and tutors, from Deans and Guidance Counsellors, from parents, family and whānau, and from peers.

In schools, this advice is often provided by career advisors, working with young people who need some help to make sense of career information, helping to clarify study choices. This could include placement on a STAR or Gateway programme so that a young person can gain direct experience of particular occupations, careers and industries.

Career advice may become more important as the vocational pathways develop. The vocational pathways will provide many young people with access to a more structured approach to learning in the senior school, in school tertiary partnerships or in tertiary provision.

Careers New Zealand supports its information function with career advice through its website. The website includes sections tailored to the needs of Māori and Pasifika people, young people and their families, and migrants. Other services include interactive web-based tools for career development, advice delivered through a network of regional offices and an 0800 Advice Line.

Key issues

ERO evidence from their 2006 review tells us the quality of advice in schools, and other CIAGE services, can be variable. It is still largely focused on providing career information, not always well-targeted and not always well-integrated with wider learner support services. However, some schools offer career advice which is well-linked to wider learner support (such as STAR and Gateway placements) with strong links to employers and parents and whānau. It seems that a key factor determining the role of career advice in a school, as with all aspects of CIAGE, is the commitment of senior leadership in the school.

Similar reviews have not been carried out in tertiary institutions so it is unclear what the quality of career advice is and whether it is always in the best interests of the learner.

We know that parents and families and whānau are key influencers of young peoples' education, training and work choices. However the knowledge that these key influencers have can be limited and dated. We need to work with parents, families and whānau in a way that empowers them to effectively help their young people to make the best choices for them.

Possible changes

Some ideas for change are:

- (A) Learners could continue to access career advice from many sources and services. However, to ensure that advice is of high quality, there could be clear expectations provided for both schools and tertiary providers to ensure that learners have access to high quality career advice. ERO reviews could have a stronger focus on career advice in schools. Tertiary providers could also be reviewed against a set of performance measures for career advice.
- (B) Current resourcing could be more broadly related to the function of career advice rather than a particular delivery model.
- (C) Schools, tertiary providers and local employers could set up partnership arrangements to provide career advice about education, training and employment in local areas. This could also involve community groups to provide a linkage with parents, families and whānau.

Key questions

- 1. How can we encourage more consistent delivery of high quality advice across the schooling and tertiary sectors?
- 2. How can we ensure career advice is well informed by employer perspectives in local areas?
- 3. How can we involve parents, families and whānau in a way that:
 - meets the needs of diverse range of groups
 - helps young people, especially those from priority groups, make choices that are effective and appropriate for them.

Career Guidance

Outcome

Targeted young people can access special assistance to develop and implement their career-related plans through their emerging career management competencies.

Description

Guidance is focused on the interpretation and application of information for career planning management purposes and/or the development of underlying career management competencies.

Effective career guidance provides support for young people who need help to make considered and informed education and training and career decisions. This is a specialised intervention that draws on a body of professional theory and practice. It can take a number of forms such as:

- helping people better match their interests and aptitudes with study options and career choices;
- helping people develop a flexible, multi-stage career plan;
- helping people implement and adapt a career plan;
- helping people compare and contrast career options and different pathways;
- helping people make career-related compromises ;
- helping people adapt their career plans in response to unexpected opportunities;
- assisting people to develop skills so that they can make future career-related decisions and plans;
- multi-faceted support for learners with complex needs.

Guidance may be ongoing as young people develop their competency.

Current situation

The NAG provides a mandate for schools to provide specific career guidance (as opposed to broader guidance) and that career guidance should be provided to targeted students.

The Career Education and Guidance guidelines issued to schools in 2009 talk about 'careerguidance' within the context of broader guidance linked to schools' pastoral care role.

A small private market exists for career consultancy. Independent career practitioners offer one-to-one career development services to young people, with a range of other services. Most practitioners belong to the Career Development Association of New Zealand (CDANZ), have a minimum level six career-specific qualification and are subject to a code of conduct and a disciplinary process.

Careers New Zealand has made a policy decision not to provide career services to individuals on a fee-for-service basis as it sees this as competing with the private sector. Careers New Zealand does however offer some private consultancy work to schools and tertiary providers on a fee-for-service basis. This is a very small part of its business, involving one or two schools and one or two tertiary providers per year. It mostly involves being contracted to provide career interviews to a class or year level.

Key issues

Past reviews signal variability in the career guidance services provided to young people in schools. Studies by ERO and NZCER found that career guidance is often a relatively low priority. In particular ERO found in its 2006 review that many schools do not seem to have a systematic approach to identifying learners at high risk of making poor transitions so they can target resources effectively.

At the same time, in some schools, the learners who see the career adviser may not be those who are most in need of career guidance.

There is no requirement on tertiary providers to provide career guidance for their learners. Tertiary providers may use a portion of their bulk-funded allocation to provide or purchase advice and guidance services for their students. It is unclear whether any specific career guidance occurs.

Options for the provision of career guidance may be largely around ensuring it is available to those learners who most need it. It is an expensive intervention and provision requires a high level of professional education and training that a number of schools and tertiary providers may not be able to provide under current settings. In addition, improved career education, information and advice could mean that career guidance is more available to those who genuinely need this level of intervention.

Issues centre on how to identify who most needs career guidance, whether there is a referral role for schools and tertiary institutions and what responsibility there should be for ensuring the quality of a career guidance provider.

Some learners with multiple needs may need broader guidance and we need to consider how to ensure those learners receive the assistance they need.

Possible changes

Some ideas are outlined below:

- (A) Government could develop criteria to identify who can receive funded career guidance and career guidance could be provided proactively to those young people identified as most at risk.
- (B) Government could develop clear expectations for schools and tertiary providers on the career guidance services they offer, and expect inclusion in ERO reviews and the equivalent reporting for the tertiary sector.
- (C) Schools and tertiary organisations could choose to offer career guidance on-site or contract out this part of CIAGE to private providers. Services could be purchased through cluster arrangements.

- (D) The Ministry of Education could work with the career profession to identify the skill set needed to provide career guidance for learners and what qualifications would meet that skill set requirement.
- (E) Schools and tertiary organisations could refer learners who have multiple needs to external agencies, such as MSD or its providers, to provide this service. Alternatively an external agency could provide referrals to the range of social services already available.

Key Questions

1. How can we ensure career guidance in schools and tertiary settings is available to those learners who most need this support?
2. How do we differentiate between those who need career guidance and those with multiple needs who need broader and more intensive guidance?
3. How do we ensure that career guidance services meet the needs of our diverse learner population, in particular Māori and Pasifika learners, and learners with special education needs?
4. How can individual learners and/or educational institutions know they are accessing high quality career guidance?

Process

You can provide feedback by emailing career.review@minedu.govt.nz or by completing the key questions here:

- [Career Education: Key Questions](#)
- [Career Information: Key Questions](#)
- [Career Advice: Key Questions](#)
- [Career Guidance: Key Questions](#)

Terms of Reference for the review and a set of questions and answers are available on the Ministry of Education website at:

<http://www.minedu.govt.nz/theMinistry/EducationInitiatives/YouthGuarantee/ReviewOfCareerInformationAdviceAndGuidance.aspx>

The deadline for all feedback is 5pm 15 June 2012.